DELEGATED REPORT / CASE OFFICER'S ASSESSMENT

Ref No: ST/0298/19/HFUL
Proposal: Repair and restoration of existing window box frames to front and rear of property. Replacement of current sash windows with grade 1 redwood timber double glazed sash windows, duplicating existing patterns and designs.
Location: 11 Ashleigh Villas
East Boldon
NE36 0LA

Site Visit Made: 24/06/19

Relevant policies/SPDs

1 DM1 - Management of Development (A & B)

2 DM6 - Heritage Assets and Archaeology (Biii)

3 SPD9 - Householder Developments

4 SPD15 - East Boldon Conservation Area Management Plan - Adopted April 2009

Description of the site and of the proposals

The application site is a semi-detached property fronting onto Front Street (A184), within the East Boldon Conservation Area, close to the junction with Sunderland Road (A184) and Station Terrace (B1299).

The East Boldon Conservation Area Appraisal (2006) identifies the historic and architectural significance of the application property, which forms part of a collection of imposing two-storey buff brick houses in terraced, semi-detached or double fronted detached form, which all adopt similar designs and motifs. The properties display strong gables facing the street and are enlivened with darker brick string courses, copious timber and sandstone detailing, built using design creativity to increase their perceived grandeur.

The significance of the property's positive contribution to the character, appearance and historic significance of the East Boldon Conservation Area is reflected by the fact that the property is subject to an Article 4 direction, which removes a number of permitted development rights for the whole of the property, including those available under Part 1 Class A of the 2015 General Permitted Development Order (as amended). This means that planning permission is required in this instance for this proposal, which seeks to overhaul and replace all of the windows within the front elevation, and the three upper floor windows in the rear elevation.

Front and rear elevation plans have been provided along with detailed window specifications showing the proposed rails, glazing bars and glazed unit.

The front elevation contains two sets of bay windows with timber sashes at ground floor, one within the upper floor and two other timber sash windows at first floor. The windows are single glazed timber sashes, with secondary glazing. The proposal is to replace these in a like for like style with double glazed (4mm/10mm/4mm glazed unit) timber sashes.

At the rear, the three windows that would be replaced are again single glazed timber sashes with secondary glazing, but they have much finer glazing bars than those at the front. The application originally proposed to replace these with double glazed timber sash window, replicating the existing two over two style windows, but with much thicker glazing bars than existing, substantially reducing the amount of glazing. Following discussions, the proposals have been changed to remove the vertical glazing bars and provide a one over one style sash window, thereby reducing the amount of glazing in proportion to the frames than originally proposed.

Publicity / Consultations (Expiry date 15/07/19)

1) Neighbour & Site/Press Notice responses

None received

The East Boldon Neighbourhood Forum was also notified. No response was received.

2) Consultee responses

Historic Environment Officer

Comments on initial proposal:

With regard to the above application, I am of the view that the proposed double glazed timber sash windows to the front of the property are acceptable in terms of profile/detailing.

However, with regards to the rear multi-paned sash windows I am not comfortable with the proposed profile of the glazing bars. The existing glazing bars are quite fine but in order to be able to accommodate the weight of double glazed units, the glazing bars will have to be significantly thicker and, as a result, the area of glazing will be substantially reduced. This will affect the overall appearance of the windows considerably.

I would therefore advise that the applicant should either be prepared to repair the existing windows to the rear or, where they are considered to be beyond repair, replace them on a like-for-like basis. Overhaul/repair of existing sash windows can increase thermal efficiency through the installation of brushes etc. to reduce gaps. New units are also generally more thermally efficient.

Comments on revised proposal:

The revised plans are acceptable in heritage terms.

Assessment

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that an application for planning permission must be determined in accordance with the adopted development plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Section 72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires that in the exercise (with respect to any buildings or other land in a conservation area) of any functions special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area. If the impact of the proposal on the Conservation Area would be neutral this would be acceptable.

The main issues relevant to the assessment of this proposal are the;

- Design of the proposal and its effect on visual amenity & heritage assets;
- Impact on residential amenity;

Design/Visual Amenity/Heritage

While the property is set some distance back from the road, the front elevation of the property faces Front Street, in a fairly prominent location on a key route through East Boldon, and within the East Boldon Conservation Area. Any changes to the front of the property would therefore have significant potential to impact on the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

The proposed double glazed timber sash windows to the front of the property have been able to closely replicate the proportions and external appearance of the existing windows and are considered to be acceptable in terms of their profile and detailing. The proposed changes to the property frontage are not considered to harm the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

The double glazed multi-paned sash windows to the rear upper floor that were originally proposed in the application submission would have substantially reduced the amount of glazing compared with the existing upper floor windows. The existing glazing bars are rather fine, but in order to be able to accommodate the weight of double glazed units, the proposed glazing bars will have to be significantly thicker and, as a result, the area of glazing will be substantially reduced. This will affect the overall appearance of the windows considerably. However, efforts have also been made to redress the balance between glazing and the timber frames within the proposed rear upper floor windows through the revised proposals which have removed the vertical glazing bars from the proposals, providing a one over one panel timber sash window to each upper floor opening.

Ideally, either repairing the existing windows to the rear or replacing them on a like-for-like basis would be the optimum solutions to best protect the historic character of the property. However, as the rear elevation of the property is not visible from any publicly accessible viewpoints within the East Boldon Conservation Area, or elsewhere within the public domain, the proposal will not affect the character and appearance of the Conservation Area when experienced from within the public domain. While effects on the property's own individual historic character can be given a limited degree of weight as a non-designated heritage, much less weight can be given to effects of the proposal on the architectural detail of the rear elevation than any changes to the front.

While the Article 4 direction removes the Part 1 Class A permitted development rights from all elevations of the property, the statement of justification for issuing the direction refers to the harm that could be caused to the Conservation Area with specific reference to changes to the front elevation of the property, given its relative prominence and public visibility, but makes no specific reference to windows to the rear of the property.

It is considered that the proposal would not harm the visual amenities its immediate environs or the character, appearance and historic significance of the East Boldon Conservation Area. The proposal is considered to sufficiently convey sensitive consideration of its surroundings and protect the special character of the East Boldon Conservation Area to accord with LDF policies DM1 (A) and DM6 of the South Tyneside LDF, and having regard to guidance in SPD9 and SPD15.

Residential Amenity

The proposals would simply replace existing windows within the same openings. It is therefore considered that the proposals would not have any material impact on neighbouring residential amenity, and would be in accordance with Policy DM1 (B).

Summary

It is considered that, in the site circumstances and context of this particular case that the proposal would be in accordance with Local Development Framework (LDF) Policy DM1 (A & B), having regard to design guidance in Supplementary Planning Document (SPD) 9 'Householder Developments'. The

proposal would also be in accordance with Policy DM6 of the South Tyneside LDF, and guidance in SPD15, having regard to all other material planning considerations. It is considered that the proposal would be an acceptable form of development, subject to the conditions listed below.

In assessing this application due regard has been had to the requirement of section 149 of the Equality Act 2010.

Recommendation

Grant Permission Householder with Conditions

Conditions

1 The development to which this permission relates must be commenced not later than 3 years from the date of this permission.

As required by Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and to ensure that the development is carried out within a reasonable time.

2 The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plan(s) as detailed below

1905 W3 A received 04/07/19
1905 W4 A received 04/07/19
Window Specifications received 16/05/19

Any minor material changes to the approved plans will require a formal planning application under S73 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 to vary this condition and substitute alternative plans.

In order to provide a procedure to seek approval of proposed minor material change which is not substantially different from that which has been approved.

Informatives

1 In dealing with this application the Council has implemented the requirements of the National Planning Policy Framework to seek to approve applications for sustainable development where possible.

Case officer: Chris Stanworth
Signed:
Date: 18/07/19

Authorised Signatory:
Date:

«END»